

CO-OPERAID

Kornhausstrasse 49

P.O. Box

8042 Zurich

info@co-operaid.ch, www.co-operaid.ch

Humanitarian Foundation

Sahabuddin Building (2nd Floor)

College road, P.O., District-Bandarban-4600

Bangladesh

ihumanitarian@yahoo.com, www.hf-cht.org



Evaluation of Alu San Alusama Froi Project

(A worthy investment to make skilled work force for better tomorrow.)

Project duration: September 2011 – June 2016

Submitted By:

Subhash Chandra Saha

Freelance Consultant

Email: subhashsaha1951@yahoo.com

Cell No: 01713490615

Submitted: September 2016

Table of Contents

1.INTRODUCTION:	4
2. TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING (TVET) REFORM IN BANGLADESH	5
4. Methodological Approach for the evaluation	6
5. Salient Findings and Comments	8
5.1 Relevance	8
5.1.1 Relevance of the project goal and objectives	8
5.1.2 Relevance of the Target Group (TG) beneficiaries	8
5.1.3 Relevance of Supply and Social Demand	9
5.1.4 Relevance of Training Contents to labour market and Entrepreneurship training	9
5.1.5 Relevance of job placement to facilitate wage and self -employment	9
5.2 Effectiveness	10
5.2.1 Reaching the target groups	10
5.2.2 Functioning of planning and selection of trades	10
5.2.3 How to reach the unreachables	11
5.2.4 Curricula and Teaching Methodologies/ Training Quality	11
5.2.5 Training facilities with availability of drinking water facilities	12
5.2.6 Qualification and working conditions of instructors	12
5.2.7 Effectiveness of business (entrepreneurship) training	13
5.2.7 Availability of equipment, tools and training materials	13
5.2.8 Graduates received equipment –helpful for earning but needed its increase in number and follow up of their use	13
5.2.9 Post -Training Support:	14
a) Start up capital fund(Tk 1,500,000/)	14
b) Refresher course	14
c) Job placement	14
5.2.10 Beneficiaries' Contribution:	14
The beneficiary families being inspired contributed the training expenses despite their poverty. These included: Training fee, Admission fee , Lodging fee , Certificate fee,etc .However, some of them find difficulties to arrange the contributory amount.	14
5.3 Outcomes and Impacts	15
5.3.1 Employment of graduates	15
5.3.2 Income	16
5.3.3 Savings attitude developed	18
5. 2.4 Graduates become entrepreneurs and govt. employees	18
5.2.5 Impacts on personal and living situation of families of graduates(refer to comparative changes: Annex-5)	18
5.2.6 Interest amplified for education to prepare their children as qualified human resources	19
5.2.7 Peoples' Representatives and Local Govt Officials appreciated the initiative	19
5.2.8 Some harvestings as a testimony of positive impacts created(refer to comparative changes: Annex-5)	20
Kyashing Thowly Marma, a very popular entrepreneur at Thanchi market	20
2) Trade –Carpentry	20
PruekyShing Marma (18) dreams to open a shop	20
Raoleng knows the business tricks	21

<i>GhenSundar Chakma (40) of Chakmapara getting better yields</i>	21
5.4 Efficiency:	22
5.4.1 Efficiency of the Project	22
5.4.2 Maintenance of documents	23
5.4.3 Financial Management and Purchases with sound policies functioning	23
5.4.4 Staff Performance Appraisals warrants attention	23
5.4.5 Staff development is an integral part of development	24
5.4.6 Logical Framework Matrix (LFM) , a management tool	24
5.4.7 Monitoring and Evaluation	24
5.5 Phase over/ Sustainability /Exit Strategy	25
6. Challenges	27
7. Recommendations	27
8. Conclusion	29
9. Annexure	29

Evaluation of Alu San Alusama Froi Project

1.Introduction:

Vocational Education (VE) means learning to change one's behavior to enhance quality of life through work and values without or along with formal schooling. If the learning through the vocational approach enhances self -employment and economic productivity of the people then the war against poverty can be fought and conquered in a constructive way.

The recent Labor Force Survey 2010 finds that a vast majority of rural men and women had no access to formal vocational training (96.7% for females and 98.2% for males). In other words, only a “microscopic” segment of rural men and women could access to vocational training as early as 2010 (3.3% for females and 1.8% for males). However, it has to be noted that men have better opportunities to acquire trade skills informally (through apprenticeships) as compared to women.

Many countries like Thailand, Malaysia, Indonesia etc. have got a lot of economic benefits through vocational education. So it has been proved that economic implication of VE is many, particularly for Bangladesh having vast population of 160 million. Unfortunately the rate of providing technical and vocational education and training (TVET) is proportionately less than general education.

Most youths acquire “technical “skills in the form of an unstructured and unregulated apprenticeship, for example, in a simple roadside workshop. So the time has come for the country to find out the role of VE in poverty reduction. Although improvements have been made in poverty reduction in the country but rural poverty is still about twice as high as urban poverty, more so particularly for the hilly indigenous youths and women who are underserved, and deprived from the fruits of development of the country so far advanced. Their poverty is deep rooted .They live from hand to mouth. They were born in poverty and darkness but should not die in the same conditions. Their social mobility is still low and the poor children and teenagers’ do not have any access to the vocational training and even many of the child labors (especially girl child) do not access to primary schooling. They are unskilled labor hampering knowledge spill over and entrepreneurship.

Hence the project, Alu San Alusama Froi (Learn a Profession, Be Professional) undertaken by the Humanitarian Foundation has been rightly chosen in the right place reaching close proximity to the deserving and neglected communities with goal and three-fold objectives as under:

Main Goal: Livelihood enhancement through vocational training and business support for tribal youths and mothers in Thanchi upazila

Objective-1: Vocational training centre established, fully equipped and functional

Objective-2: Five 3-4 month-courses running for three years with a total of 630 trainees

Objective-3: Sales centre established, business support through training, market connection and start-up capital for graduates

Project Beneficiaries

Under this project, a total of 630 vulnerable households (HHs) from Thanchi Upazila under the district of Bandarban will be covered. The beneficiaries of the project will be selected through a community led selection procedure. HF will facilitate the process, while a representative portion of the community will participate and lead the process. Followings are the general criteria to select project beneficiaries :

- Education: School dropouts
- Age: 15-24 years for youths (for women and mothers: up to 45 years)
- Gender: youth and women (widow, separated, divorced women who are not able to sell labor will get priority)
- Income: Monthly income not more than BDT 2,500/
- Land property: not possessing more than 50 decimals of cultivable land or received 5 acres of land from the government as landless.

Besides, some particular criteria will be maintained for particular vocational courses as stated below:

- a. Literate youths from the above mentioned families showing interest for plant nursery/carpentry
- b. Youth women, mother and divorcees involved with traditional weaving in the family.
- c. Should complete at least primary education to apply for the basic computer course.
- d. Illiterate youths, mothers and divorcees showing interest to receive training on tailoring

2. Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Reform in Bangladesh*The TVET Reform Project is an initiative of the Government of Bangladesh, assisted by the International Labor Organization and funded by the European Union. The goal is to ensure Bangladesh's competitiveness in the global market and reduce poverty by improving the quality of vocational educational and training.*

Policy :

TVET Reform is not just about new ways of doing things; it is about changing the mindset of the TVET sector. If the sector is to meet the increasing demands of the global labor market, it needs to focus quickly on becoming flexible, inclusive, efficient and collaborative.

Relevance :

In order to meet labor demands in Bangladesh, TVET must be delivering quality skills that employers want, and these needs are constantly changing. Through improving the responsiveness and flexibility of TVET institutions, reform will enable institutions to better meet industry needs.

Strengthening :

In order for quality training to be delivered and assessed in Bangladesh, TVET practitioners need to move away from lecturing and towards practical, competency-based methods. Reform will encourage this by building the capacity of managers to understand the need for it and by improving TVET teacher training methods.

Linkages :

Stronger relationships between training institutions and industry will ensure that graduates have the skills needed by employers, so that they can together meet the increasing needs of the labour market. Reform will encourage these partnerships through Industry Skills Councils and encourage best practice through Centres of Excellence.

Access:

One of the key reform objectives is to make TVET accessible to all, including youth with low literacy and numeracy, child workers, women and rural communities and persons with disabilities. To do this, reform is concentrating on removing policy-related barriers, such as minimum education levels, and also physical barriers, such as transport systems which are not gender-friendly.

Constituents and Partners

The TVET Reform Project extends technical assistance to the Government of Bangladesh primarily through the following skills-related government agencies:

- Ministry of Education (MoE)
- Ministry of Labour and Employment (MoLE)
- Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB)
- Directorate of Technical Education (DTE)
- Bureau of Manpower Employment and Training (BMET)

3. Scope of Evaluation

Subject of the evaluation is the second phase (2015-2017) ending its 1st phase (2012-2014). The donor agency, CO-OPERAID has been funding this initiative since inception. Total budget of two phases (6 –year period) amounts to Tk 40,227,194/

Purpose of this external project evaluation is to assess achievements, outcomes and impacts and to provide recommendations for further development of the project by considering the changes in the environment of Alu San Alusama Froi and the impacts so far made (Refer to ToR – Annex-1 attached)

4. Methodological Approach for the evaluation

The evaluation has been carried out in September 2016 following the Terms of Reference (ToR) and Itinerary. The evaluator has gone under project briefing, documents study, field visit, sharing of draft report and finalization of report.

The evaluation was conducted in a participatory; learning oriented approach, with the aim to cover the widest possible participation of the project beneficiaries in different steps of the evaluation process .The methodology of the evaluation had the following elements:

Introductory Meeting: An introductory meeting was organized with the Executive Director, the Program Director and the Project Co-ordinator, which included a first orientation on the project; finalize the list of respondents, prepared draft checklist for the evaluation, finalization of itinerary, etc.

Literature Study: The documents for literature study included project proposal, project progress reports, and other documents related to the project, etc.

Approach of the Evaluation: The whole process of review was participatory involving dialogue and discussion throughout the process during which findings and alternative strategies were constantly discussed with project staff and beneficiaries (respondents), important stakeholders. The evaluation approach was considered as developmental rather than judgmental and was guided by Appreciative Enquiry approach.

Interview: Focus Group Discussions(FGDs) and Key Informants Interview (KII) were conducted with the beneficiaries .Discussions were also conducted with the organisation management on project progress problems and prospects, lessons learned, sustainability strategy, capacity building of staff , recommendations through participatory process in a very friendly atmosphere.

De-briefing of Findings: Observations and findings were shared with organization management.

Report Sharing: Draft report was shared with the organization management and staff members of the project to minimize misunderstanding if any and also to update any other missing areas, include suggestions, etc. before finalization of the report. Based on the feedback and comments, the final evaluation report has been prepared.

Tools used: Checklist, Observation during interview, and PRA tool –Now (After Training) and Then (Before Training).

Key Respondents

- Some trainees, employed, unemployed (direct beneficiaries) of different trades,
- Project Key staffs
- Upazila Chairman, Thanchi
- Upazia Vice Chairman, Thanchi
- Incharge-Youth Development Dept, Thanchi
- Incharge-Children and Women Affairs, Thanchi, GOB
- The Executive Director -Humanitarian Foundation(HF)
- The Program Director- HF

Critical Reflection

This report is the product of a fruitful cooperation of a number of people. Without their cooperation during the evaluation process, the results and findings presented in this report would not have been achieved. During the visits of the project activities the evaluator received a variety and diversity of information and impressions of the engagement of project beneficiaries and the staff. Their opinion becomes crucial in order to evaluate performances, relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability of the project.

Due to inaccessible areas, the evaluator could not visit most of the respondent's houses or places of work to see their real situations with naked eyes; hence the evaluation report is not a full picture of the impact of the project created. It is limited to the interviews of the respondents the evaluator met.

Moreover, the project does not maintain baseline data and information of the graduates to compare the changes/improvements of their living standard due to intervention. Hence the evaluator used one of the PRA tools (Before Training and After Training) for comparison of changes.

The different elements for judgement that the evaluator was able to grasp certainly do not reflect the complexity and totality of results and outcomes of the project interventions. Despite of these limitations, the findings and recommendations of this report might contribute to further improvement of the project proposals, efficiency and sustainability of the project.

5. Salient Findings and Comments

5.1 Relevance

5.1.1 Relevance of the project goal and objectives

The project goal and objectives are undeniably very much pertinent to the wishes and concerns of its beneficiaries, looking into their poverty reduction through skill development in different marketable trades.

The project has been able to reach the outreach targeted indigenous people who are denied of their basic rights. And they are the people suffering from chronic poverty. The project gives them an opportunity to get them admitted into the training centre, become skilled work force. As a result of this opportunity, they can enter into job market, able to get employment, build their future better than before. To them the project is an eye opener. They said, "We do not now borrow money for survival from money lenders who charge exorbitant rate of interest (120%-140% per annum)."

The project aligns with Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which among others states as follows: "Goal 1-No Poverty, Goal 2: Zero Hunger, Therefore, goal and objectives of the project interventions are still valid in Bangladesh and in local context. Hence it should keep on its noble journey.

5.1.2 Relevance of the Target Group (TG) beneficiaries

This is a project that stands by the people in need and aims for livelihood enhancement through vocational training and business support. The target beneficiaries are extreme poor living on jhum

cultivation(slash and burn), which is gradually reducing due to reduction of land and their productivity, increase of population, etc. Hence off-farm livelihood opportunities are increasingly important.

5.1.3 Relevance of Supply and Social Demand

The communities have fairly well received the project. Being inspired ,they those who can afford contribute in the form of training fee, admission fee and bear partly the cost of food and lodging. They said, It is their life blood for their better tomorrow and alternative source for their livelihood. This opportunity has appeared to them as wakeup call to make un-skilled hands into skilled hands.

During discussion in the project locations, the participants wanted to continue FGD where they were noticed very attentive and responsive even after fading away of day light. They shared their success and shortcomings. Some of them came from far distant places to express their gratefulness for setting up this kind of opportunity for them.

The demand is high in the case of females (in particular tailoring). Demand for tailoring courses clearly exceeds the supply with sometimes twice as much applicant as available capacities. The project is providing a unique opportunity for females. There is literally no other training provider in project area that offers quality vocational training right at the doorstep of rural villages.

The selection criteria and training period are suitable for facilitating for the disadvantaged people who have to work and earn income alongside training or who are responsible for household duties. The local important stakeholders like Upazila Chairman, Vice Chairman, and other Govt. machinery are very much supportive to the project and wish its continuity unconditionally.

5.1.4 Relevance of Training Contents to labor market and Entrepreneurship training

All the above features are relevant to employable graduates and facilitate employment. The training syllabi have been designed to respond to rural market demands. However, technical curriculum content is to be updated in consultation with employers to cope with the changing trend.

At the moment the training is designed for 60% theoretical and 40% practical. The FGDs suggested to increase the practical classes to the extent of 80%.Hence is needed the revision of syllabi.

Entrepreneurship plays a very important role in the economic development. Entrepreneurs act as catalytic agents in the process of economic growth. With the setting up of more units by entrepreneurs, numerous job opportunities are created for others.

Entrepreneurship training is very much demanding and relevant for self-employment according to the opinion of the graduates but the amount of time spent for this training is less. (refer to its effectiveness in the report).

5.1.5 Relevance of job placement to facilitate wage and self -employment

The FGDs revealed that the employed people in the field of wage and self -employment got assistance from the project team but needed more drive from the Monitoring Officer(MO) .They wished that MO gives all out efforts to inform them about the employment opportunities-locally, regionally /nationally or abroad. His assistance is very much essential to the graduates who want

to access to city (which is not the life concept of many graduates, many prefer an employment opportunity closer to their homes, mainly in Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHTs).

During FGDs it was learnt some graduates after job placement at far off places (from own area-Thanchi to Rangamati) left without notice to the employers and co-workers after few days. They said, they left as they do not like to stay at the periphery of their own upazila. This is not unlikely to them. Similar experience at the beginning of the project was expressed by the BTTC (Bandarban Technical Training Center) Manager, a project of Caritas. Hence it is imperative to conduct motivational classes during the training course about migration and challenges-behavior with the co-workers, employers, buyers, Do's and Don'ts, etc. It will be more practical if one or two graduates employed elsewhere out of their periphery discuss in the training class and share their experiences.

5.2 Effectiveness

To assess the effectiveness of the project focuses on the extent of objectives achieved and the major factors influencing the intensity of achievements.

5.2.1 Reaching the target groups

The project reached the target group of Thanchi Upazila following the selection criteria with respect to education, age, income, gender and agricultural land holding. The relatively high educational background (college level in some cases) of females was trained in tailoring. But there are no any trainees from the wealthier families. Since beginning of the project:

A number of 398(F-178) trainees was enrolled in different five trades in the first phase (Table -1 attached).

Of them, 397 graduated, (99.7%)

Dropout rate is insignificant (0.25 %.)

While the same is noticed in the first year of the second phase (Table2 attached).

The percentage of achievement against target of 630 of the first phase was 64%. The reasons assigned were that in the first year there was only one trade (computer), so trainees for the remaining four trades were not enrolled for obvious reason.

A number of 179(F- 108) trainees as against target of 200 was enrolled in different five trades in the 1st year of the second phase, per cartage being 90% (Table -2 attached)

Of them, 100% graduated.

5.2.2 Functioning of planning and selection of trades

A culture of planning and review system exists to attain the target as made but a weak point in the planning process was that there were lack of participatory labour market assessment mechanisms in selection of marketable trades .It was not appropriate to continue the same trade without assessment of their impact the project should analyze the emerging demand every year and replace the trade training to cope up with the needs (local and country context) however, in

compliance with the capacity of the project or otherwise the capacity of the project needs to be upgraded to adapt the changing trend.

Therefore attention is drawn to conduct marketable trades training –short term and long term varying from one week to 12 weeks. The FGDs and discussion with Youth Development Dept reveal that at the moment demands are of electrical, batik and boutik along with tailoring, beauty parlor (hot cake business in Bangladesh, where most of the employees are indigenous girls), mobile phone servicing, mason, sanitary and toilet ring slab making, cow fattening, etc) .Very recently the Thanchi Upazila will be brought under power supply. Therefore electric wiring and development of infrastructure /house building/repairing may take place.

5.2.3How to reach the unreachable

The project may open another unit called Mobile Trade Training Center (MTTC) alongside the existing Fixed Training Center (FTC) to reach the unreachable people with appropriate trades after rapid study. This is very much cost effective. The project management may discuss with Caritas Chittagong Office in this regard. They are pioneer in this field (to reach the unreached).Otherwise the FTC may increase the dormitory facilities for both boys and girls with separate boundaries for the benefit of the people, especially of inaccessible areas. It will be a blessing to them.

5.2.4 Curricula and Teaching Methodologies/ Training Quality

The project has developed its own set of syllabi, trainer manuals and testing guidelines. The FGDs focused that the instructors talked more and had less scope on listening to the trainees, which the evaluator endorsed his view when observing one class as a testimony.

The syllabi are designed in a conventional way, spelling out teaching subjects and the time allocated. They do not cover features of modern curricula such as competence levels and learning objectives. With the introduction of a National Qualification Framework (NQF) and Competency Based Training at the national level the project as a whole needed to thoroughly reform the syllabi and teaching materials.

Some instructors tend to place too much emphasis on theory content, which is difficult to be understood by learners with low educational level (feedback of the graduates). The instructors' conventional way of teaching is not very effective according to observation of the evaluator and feedback of the graduates.

In pricing of products, many young graduates are lost. They do not consider their own working time and regard it as an ample convenience not to be calculated. Instructors' attention is drawn in this regard.

The FGDs revealed that in case of trade training as many as 55% graduates /trainees interviewed expressed their satisfaction while 15% were half satisfied and the 30% not satisfied about the quality of training.

The following Table provides a summary of the qualitative feedback of graduates / trainees on their satisfaction and their suggestions how to improve the program:

Reasons why happy	Reasons why not happy	Suggestions for further development
Before we did not have skills and no opportunity for receiving training. Tools and equipment are available. Teachers' behavior is well. There are scopes for weaker trainees to upgrade their knowledge in extra time. Literacy classes are those who are weak in understanding in Bangla necessary for mainstreaming.	Too much time spent for discussion and it is monotonous and test taken once a month.	More time needed for intensive practical training (80%) in place of 60%. Undertaking frequent test (at least after end of each lesson) suggested for more participatory discussion

Note: This table displays a variety of feedback from different FGDs on the same issues ranging from very positive to negative statements.

After orientation on the project they were deployed. Training of Trainer (TOT) activities were not provided to them. There were no scopes for skills up-gradation for them. The instructors needed to acquire facilitation skill. The lesson plan followed has room for further development. It should have among others:

- a) Performance objectives of particular lesson,
- b) Training equipment (Use of White Board, Flip Chart, Marker pen, Overhead Projector, etc.
- c) Training methods like-brain storming/participatory discussion /game etc
- d) Time given depending on the nature of topic,

5.2.5 Training facilities with availability of drinking water facilities

The project set up training centre in a very good environment along with dormitory facilities especially for girls who hail from far flung areas of difficult communication.

The project has made it possible to have drinking water, which in hilly areas is a dream. It will not be out of place to mention here that some neighbouring families have easy access to fetch water from the sources. They expressed their appreciation to the authority for their great services and permission, saying it is a blessing to them.

The local government officials (Upazila Chairman, Vice Chairman, Women Affairs Officer In - charge, Youth Dev. Dept) and NGO-BRAC made creditable statements for the facilities made available in such an inaccessible place.

5.2.6 Qualification and working conditions of instructors

The evaluator found a variety of instructors in the field ranging from very experienced instructors with 3-12 years of experience to newly recruited, less experienced ones (graduated

from Caritas Technical School in Bandarban) replacing the experienced one due to child bearing. Some of them got Diploma after Secondary School Exam.

The instructors have a physically challenging task. They stay far away from their families for the most part of the year. Considering these challenging work conditions most instructors have high level of motivation with pro-activeness. They were found happy to work in a friendly atmosphere. One positive element is they belong to same communities. They have commitment to assist their communities to help alleviating poverty and produce productive human resources to lead the backward communities.

5.2.7 Effectiveness of business (entrepreneurship) training

The interviewed graduates especially of computer, tailoring, and carpentry aim at self-employment saying they will start when they will have necessary capital. This training was arranged after the trainees passed out. Few graduates could recall key entrepreneurship topics in the FGD. Many graduates said entrepreneurship training should be intensified especially in the last months of the training. This training received the lowest satisfaction rate in spite of its importance.

The project provided training to the graduates in a certain time after end of the training course for a couple of days. They found it difficult to attend leaving their work. Hence it is suggested to conduct this training at the end part of the training course. Therefore, the syllabi needs to be revised incorporating the contents of entrepreneurship training. Instructors also should get on-the-job training in this field to become equipped in conducting the training in the class.

5.2.7 Availability of equipment, tools and training materials

Considering the nature of the training provided (basic level skills) the project is sufficiently equipped with necessary equipment, tools and teaching materials. The trainees and the graduates expressed their satisfaction in this regard. The project management is happy to share with the evaluator that the donor is very much considerate for effective training. Hence were replaced old and obsolete equipment. This facilitated much in conducting training.

5.2.8 Graduates received equipment –helpful for earning but needed its increase in number and follow up of their use

The project has some provisions to provide equipment after satisfactory completion of training. The interviewed graduates are happy and said these are useful for their employment and earning. It appears from project document that

- 19% out of 85 graduates of carpentry received their equipment(such as –hammers, saw, slab, tape, scissile ,etc)
 - 12% out of 114 graduates of computer received their equipment(such as CPU,/laptop)
 - 15% out of 164 graduates of plant nursery received their equipment(such as spray machine ,secateurs, grubber, anti-insect net, etc)
-

- 16% out of 138 graduates of tailoring received their sewing machine
- 9% out of 75 graduates of weaving received some equipment

The monitoring report should bring it out to see that the tools given are properly used.

5.2.9 Post -Training Support:

a) Startup capital fund(Tk. 1,500,000/)

A serious constraint was being faced by the young ex-trainees who wanted to start business. They needed startup capital. It targets mainly the graduates. During the second phase it has been introduced and given to nine graduates (F---3) for Tk. 264,000/ with no interest. The repayment of the money loaned out is Tk. 56,780/(88%) as against expectation of Tk 64,700/.Mentioned that the startup capital has been introduced i.e in the second year of the second phase.

This support is helpful to run the business but should be given after thorough study along with recommendation of the local leaders (Union Parishad/council Councilors/ Headman in the loan application form so that they can act as a pressure group in the locality. The startup capital scheme should be governed along with guidelines. Its experience is mixed. Some did well and some left for unknown places unnoticed, thus refund of getting capital becomes uncertain. The project may refer such interested entrepreneurs to Youth Development dept (Govt. wing) to deal with them. It is learnt they offer such soft loan.

b) Refresher course

Another concern is that the project cannot do much about is the absence of opportunities for further skills training. This is badly needed as eloquently said by some graduates during FGDs. They face rapidly changing use of equipment and training contents. However, the project may not provide such skills up gradation due to financial limitations. It could be arranged at cost (with flexibility case basis, considering the financial ability).

c) Job placement

The job placement service aims at graduates who seek employment opportunities outside their communities. The Logical Framework of the project indicates target on the expected employment status of each individual graduate but not trade wise and also missed whether the placement was successful (see section monitoring and evaluation).The services of the Monitoring Officer (suggested to redesign- ate as Fund Raising and Job Placement Officer) are extremely helpful for the graduates, mainly the boys /males while female graduates intend to start home-based income generating activities rather than applying for jobs outside the village due to lack of security and assigned job for the family.

5.2.10 Beneficiaries ‘Contribution:

The beneficiary families being inspired contributed the training expenses despite their poverty. These included: Training fee, Admission fee, Lodging fee, Certificate fee, etc .However, some of them find difficulties to arrange the contributory amount.

5.3 Outcomes and Impacts

The project development goal is 'Livelihood enhancement through vocational training and business support for tribal youths and mothers in Thanchi upazila. This appeared in progress as evidenced from the following information:

5.3.1 Employment of graduates

According to project statistics, 59% are self-employed and wage-employed regardless of gender and trade. If considered the results of discussion collectively and individually with as many as 65 graduates during evaluation (35 boys and men), it revealed that 80 % graduates of all trades except those of weaving are in employment (wage and self) in the fields of training. The remaining 20% (mostly graduates in weaving group) is out of the fields of training reportedly due to lack of sewing machine, scope of work, and some of them are students and married. Graduates of weaving except some (4) who are working in the training center were found involved in their jhum cultivation. Some school students received computer training are not using their learning or practicing (no scope even in the respective areas for practice) so they are forgetting and it is obvious.

Follow up is warranted to see if the tools given are in proper use or not. The monitoring report should look into it. However, the comparison of the employment rate on average in the field of training shows a substantial positive change -which can be directly attributed to the project. Before training some boys frankly admitted that they passed their time indolently and mixed with bad companions and apprehending that they might involve in some anti-social activities, which would create tension in the family and the society as well. They are happy to see a trend of progress in reducing poverty of their families after receipt of VE.

Employment and income depend on the trade. In case of carpentry, computer and tailoring, graduates (not all) were competent enough to start work right after completing the course. In case of plant nursery, the trained people involved themselves in organic farming and expressed their happiness to get yields than before in terms of quantity and quality.

For tailoring trade, industrial attachments can be useful and helpful for those trainees who want to work in a garment industry. Some of them are already employed in garments industry (Lumbani Garments Factory) in Bandarban sadar (Hence it is imperative to develop a fruitful working relationship with major employers in this sector.

In weaving trade, the FGDs reveal that this trade is not benefitting them rather they get more return from their jhum cultivation (slash and burn practices) where the whole family members become involved for at least eight months a year. The project team tried (still trying) their level best to convince that they need to be involved in small scale industry because of black and bleak picture in the days to come of the jhum cultivation (a telling response from the Executive Director of HF was that the jhum cultivation is a losing concern .He shared the cost benefit analysis with the jhumia beneficiaries but in vain). The cultivation faces some challenges like heavy rain fall and or drought, but garment products in Bangladesh has a hot cake business.

They need to be motivated to prepare some other products other than towel, bedcover, curtain only. Due to insufficient number of weaving machine, some weavers spend their time indolently, and this created frustration among them. For instance, for 11 group members

(Mariam para), there installed two machines. Moreover due to lack of communication in time between weavers and the project personnel, other raw materials are not made available to the spot, when needed.

5.3.2 Income

a) In case of tailoring trade, monthly income of graduates (self-employed, none were wage employed) varies from Tk 1,500(with machine) to Tk3, 000 depending on the number of population of their living place. However, the income leaps to Tk3, 500/-Tk4, 000/ during religious festivals like Christmas, *Probarana and Sangrai*. It is not their full time job. They did the work besides other household duties.

Husbands need to be motivated to participate and assist their wife besides jhum cultivation during field visits of the project team. It needs a series of discussion to change the mindset of the spouse without blaming the persons. It is the socialization process.

b)In the field of carpentry, monthly income of wage employed graduates varies from Tk3,000/(beginners)-Tk6,000/ excluding food and accommodation expenses while self-employed graduates' monthly earning varies from Tk 25,000-Tk35,000. In addition, they have created employment opportunities for others (some of them were ex-trainees of Alu San Alusama Froi project).

c)In case of computer trade, it appears from discussion with Mong Thowai Marma, Mong Tyewshing Marma who received training in 2013 that their monthly income varies from Tk 16,000/-19,000/ .They have got Govt. job in Thanchi Upazila through competitive test. Another graduated woman, Tarzin Akter received job in a Govt. run primary school .Her knowledge in computer added value to get the job .She is getting Tk 18,000/ per month.

Monthly income of Kyashing at the beginning (2014) was Tk 10,000/. It is now (June 2016) augmented to Tk 25,000/-Tk30, 000/. He has employed a boy (Thongleng Khumi) who was also graduated from Alu San training center. He is given Tk 3,000/ a month along with food and accommodation facilities. Kyashing has also assisted the boy to get himself admitted into an open university in Class IX because of his poverty.

Those who are employed elsewhere are getting emolument of Tk 3,000-Tk4, 000 as beginners along with food and accommodation facilities. There are some of the graduates in computer found unemployed. For instance: Sing Swee Mong Marma who assists his 6-member family in jhum cultivation. Another graduate, Cl Mong hla Marma, graduated in 2013 is a student. He will appear college final (2017). He worked for six months in a Light House with an ex-trained boy of Alu San Alusama Froi project but was constrained to leave the job to assist her only old mother in jhum cultivation.

d) In case of plant nursery, the graduates explained the benefits of training with reference to those situations encountered before training as follows:

<i>Parameters</i>	<i>Before training</i>	<i>After training</i>

Awareness in cropping	Understand mono cropping only They had paddy and mango production only Seasonal cultivation	Knowledge gained on multiple cropping. Vegetable cultivation in almost all seasons, along with paddy and mango production
Homestead	Remained fallow	Bringing under cultivation
Use of fertilizer	Chemical fertilizers	Organic fertilizers
Top soil	Destroyed due to use of chemical fertilizers	Improved
Productivity	Less and less -gradually	More because of technology transfer
Insecticides	Frequent attack by insecticides	Less attack
Quality of products	Poisonous food	Safe food
Sale-proceeds	Less	More
Profit	Less	More
Sustainability	Unsustainable due to modern cultivation	Environment friendly and Sustainable agriculture due to organic farming

There is a case in point. Evaching Marma of Neidaripara got training from the Alu San – training center in the year 2016(Jan). He used his learning and got profit of Tk 50,000/_for vegetable cultivation. Production of safe food security is his ultimate objective of learning.

He has purchased 10 acres of land for Tk 30,000/_. Moreover, he has planted 1,800 *segun* plants (furniture wood, very much demanding, and rarely available). After 10 years, he estimated that he would get Tk1, 800,000/ from this plantation (@ Tk 1,000/ per plant).

f) In case of weaving, the graduates could weave 2-3 pieces of towel a day (variation exists) and earn Tk 1,800-Tk. 2,700/(@tk 30 per towel) a month. The reasons stated elsewhere in the report indicate that the present set up (2 machines for 11 members for example) provided do not help the graduates to become involved fully, hence the income is unsatisfactory. They experienced pressure from their families for better income.

5.3.3 Savings attitude developed

One of the elementary quests of one's life is how one can protect one's life from its very uncertainties. The graduates interviewed want to live a beautiful and joyful life. It appears that almost 25% of them (no females) have opened bank account. They bank their income after supporting their respective families and self –maintenance. It is a good attitude developed.

During the course of training, all the trainees need to be motivated about the importance of saving money for future.

5. 2.4 Graduates become entrepreneurs and govt. employees

There appear from FGDs that some graduates (no statistics available with the project) run their business, have employed 2-3 people who received training from Alu San Alusama Froi training center. (ref: a) AlKayoshing Marma, a graduate in 2014 has a carpentry shop in Thanchi Bazer, b) Kyashing Thoway Marma , a graduate in 2012 has a computer shop in Thanchi bazer, c) some graduates (joint business) have a carpentry shop at Bolipara Bazer at the Thanchi Upazila .

Some graduates during FGDs shared with happiness that they have entered into Govt. jobs as stated elsewhere in the report.

5.2.5 Impacts on personal and living situation of families of graduates (refer to comparative changes: Annex-5)

Findings in this section are based on qualitative statements of graduates in FGDs and observations. Jobs and income are important factors for the social status of pass- outs/graduates.

The far majority of the graduates reached by the project did not have a source of income (except jhum cultivation) before training. They have found it as a source of earning after becoming (semi-) skilled workers. None of them had money in hand (except those of plant nursery with meager income).Most of the graduates was involved in their traditional jhum cultivation with other family members. They were surplus labors in the family. Their future was uncertain.

In general there is an enhanced level of self –confidence of those working and practicing their trade. Although the income improvement is often limited, but impact on personality and dignity are visible as the statements made in FGDs as follows:

“Our husbands co-operate with us and show respect”

“We do not wait for our husbands to come with money to buy the daily essentials; we can buy with our money”

“We feel proud when we offer gifts to our husbands during any festivals.”

“My husband after four years of marriage left me. I received training on tailoring. I got machine from the center. I am earning and maintaining cost of living with one of my daughters, said by Athoisu Marma of Thanchi Bazer-.”

“In our daily meal, food items are more than one. Their quality is better- eloquently said by all the graduates involved in the field of training.”

“We have built /rebuilt our house. They have more assets (rearing pig, chicken, planting trees, extending agricultural fields, etc) than before”

“We are welcomed in our societies; some appeared vindictive to see our better changes of life style”.

“Now we feel the changes of our family and also my personal. It was a terrible situation to maintain the family expenditure when our income was dependent only on jhum cultivation and that time we produced 1000-1500kgs of paddy from the cultivation and a little amount of soya and vegetables. Most of the year, we had faced some deficits of rice and income from the cultivation.”

Graduates of carpentry, computer and plant nursery are satisfied (variation exists) with their personal situation. In spite of this, each and everybody being bread winners are under pressure from their parents or families to earn more income. Furthermore, some young graduates are planning to marry, hence needed more money to maintain a family.

The income of male and female graduates is often directly contributing to family wellbeing like children's/brothers'and sisters'education and health. The training provided helps to diversify sources of income and to some extent increases income security. They feel themselves dignified and honored in the families and the society as well. The women have now say in the family as the resources filter through them.

5.2.6 Interest amplified for education to prepare the children as qualified human resources

The concern of the parents for education either formal or vocational of their children is mounting despite their poverty. They said, the education is an appropriate instrument to fight against poverty. Some of their children read in schools and colleges. Their opinion is that their children should not follow their destiny. Without education they cannot enter into job market. Like others a statement of Gyana Sundar Chakma of Kamala Bagan para, Thanchi is notable. He wishes to invest his hard earned savings for education of his children. He does not want to build concrete houses. These will not last long.

5.2.7 Peoples' Representatives and Local Govt. Officials appreciated the initiative

The evaluator met separately with peoples'representatives, Upazila Chairman Mr. Kyaw Hla Ching, Upazila Vice chairman (Female)- Ms. Bakuli Marma, and local Govt. Officials namely Md Salim of Youth Dev Dept, and In charge of Child and Women Affairs of Thanchi Upazila.

It was a long discussion. Each and everybody eloquently spoke of the benefits of the project and thanked the donor. By the by they said, they are proud to contribute some cash and kinds (sewing machine) to the project in spite of their limited fund and it will continue in the upcoming days. They told the evaluator to request the donor to prolong their benevolent support for the deserving communities.

5.2.8 Some harvestings as a testimony of positive impacts created (refer to comparative changes: Annex-5)

1) Trade – Computer

Kya Shing Thowai Marma, a very popular entrepreneur at Thanchi market

Kya Shing (28) of Bandarban received computer training from the training center of Alu sama Froi project in 2012 (batch 3). After training he went to Bandarban and joined his nephew's computer shop. He was given Tk 1,000 a month excluding food and accommodation facilities. He worked there for two years. Thereafter he came back to Thanchi. As decided he purchased one computer and other accessories for Tk 150,000/ that includes Tk. 75,000/ of his own and relatives and the remaining amount (interest free) he borrowed from Humanitarian Foundation. He opened a shop at Thanchi Bazar very near to its entrance. The location has been rightly selected. As there is no power supply, he runs computer with the help of generator/ solar system.

Income at the beginning (2014) was Tk 10,000/ a month. It is now (June 2016) augmented to Tk 25-30,000/. Meanwhile he paid back almost 50% of his loan to Humanitarian Foundation out of his income. He is assisted by a boy (Thongleng Khumi) who was also graduated from Alusama Froi training center. He is given Tk 3,000/ a month along with food and accommodation facilities. Kya Shing also has assisted to get him admitted in Open University in Class IX because of his poverty.

Among others almost all NGOs and Govt. Offices are his customers. The evaluator visited his shop personally more than once. He has a very pleasing personality having good characteristics of a successful entrepreneur. He assisted to one of his brothers in Bandarban by lending some amount of money. He bears expenses of his old mother and educational expenses of his nephew. He planted mango and litchi plants (110) at his 2.5 areas of land in Thanchi, Bandarban. These will give a good return after 4-5 years. He spent some amount of his earning to repair one of his houses. In a smile he said, he is going to marry shortly. He is thankful to HF and the donor for their contribution to make skilled hands for the deserving communities.

2) Trade – Carpentry

Prue kya Shing Marma (18) dreams to open a shop

Prue Kya Shing of Ruma sadar, a neighboring Upazila of Thanchi received training in carpentry in Alusama Froi center in 2014. He read up to class V. Being poor he was dropped out from schooling. After training he learnt in making chair, show case etc. Just after finishing the training, he got a job in furniture shop of Ubaching Marma who was earlier a carpentry instructor of Alusama Froi project. After leaving the job he started this shop at Thanchi Bazar (Bus Stand).

Prue Kya Shing was given Tk 1,500/ besides his food and accommodation facilities. He worked for three months. He was then hired by a *Bangalee* shop keeper at Thanchi Bazar for Tk 3,000/ a month besides his food and accommodation expenses. After giving services for two months he joined a Marma shop for Tk4, 000/ excluding other facilities. He worked there for four months. The first employer again hired him for Tk 5,000/ a month with other facilities. He is still working there till the interview with the evaluator. He deserves more salary-he said.

Prue Kya Shing with his parents has six members. His two brothers read in school and the parents are jhum cultivators. He can bank Tk2,000/ a month out of his salary after necessary expenses . He has made some assets like rearing of goat (1), pig worth of Tk 3,500/. He was happy to share that he could at least ensure food security being trained and employed. Before training he was vagabond, unskilled and empty- handed.

The ex-trainer and Prue Kya Shing wish that the project should continue to stand by the side of the indigenous communities who are neglected.

3) Trade-Tailoring

Raoleng knows the business tricks

Raoleng Mro (19) of Aungpu para, Thanchi received tailoring training in second phase (2015). After end of the training she was given sewing machine. In her para (small village) there inhabited 33 families who used to go to Thanchi bazar to make their dresses. Now most of them come to her. She charges less than the market fees to attract the customers. For example, she said, in case of Tops (girls'dress) she charges Tk150 while it is Tk200 in the market place. She earns Tk 1,200/-1,500/ a month. Besides, she prepares dresses of her own family members, thus she can save the expenses. This is also an income- she said.

She is happy that she can bear her own expenses. She feels proud when she offers gifts to her parents during different festivals. She are honored in the society after being trained. She dreams that she will open a shop in the para/village when she will have required money in hand.

4) Trade -Plant Nursery

Gyana Sundar Chakma (40) of Kamala Bagan para getting better yields

Gyano Sundar Chakma received plant nursery training from Alusama Froi project in 2013. He had banana and mango garden but their size were small and gardens were attacked by insects .He was frustrated for not to have the desired yields. He depended on his fate saying it is his willing. In these unwelcomed days, he once came to know about the training center run by Humanitarian Foundation at Thanchi.

“Before receipt of training he would not know what to do when the flower buds appear on the plant and what should he do before the flowers buds on the plant? But now he has learned about the technique on caretaking of his garden and used it in his mango garden successfully.

However, in the year 2015, a total of almost 800 kilogram mangos were harvested from his garden and he got the net income of Tk. 15,000/ by selling the mango. He says, “I know, it is

not a decent income but it exceeded the earlier figure and their quality and size attracted the customers. He is confident that he will get a good harvest in future using his training -learning.

Some neighbors (Madu Mongal, Sukhamoy and Bina Chakma) observed the better looking of his garden and income thereof and asked for his advice. He shared out his learning with them and whoever asked for. They also got dividends.

His living standard changed for better. He admitted that he used to involve himself in jhum cultivation, which of late had poor yields compared to expenses and time given. He advised the project management to conduct training at the village level. Let the trainer go to the trainees. His experiences were that the farmers are reluctant to attend the training for consecutive long period. Let the trainer visit the villagers and hold FGDs enquiring the problems encountered. On the basis of discussions the problems will be prioritized and the trainer will help them in group in solving them.

5.4 Efficiency:

5.4.1 Efficiency of the Project

The project provided training to 397 boys and girls/women as planned against 630 trainees as stated under effectiveness. The project is facing challenges to fulfill the target of trainees of weaving and plant nursery trade, in particular.

Resource utilization (staff service and money) is satisfactory. From the financial statement, it appears that the percentage of amount spent of the first phase against the budget was 89% while it is 107% of the 1st year budget of the second phase for implementation of all the planned activities.

The planning and review culture of project activities periodically is a critical element in implementing the project efficiently, which the project team is in practice (shortcoming is no assessment is done on market demand in selecting trade).

The project implementation team is experienced and sincere. The team is composed of qualified staff members and skilled instructors (variation exists). The team is able to smoothly and quickly phase into the project.

The efficiency of a project/program is contingent upon the project governance and management system. The system in case of the project under evaluation appears appropriate. At the very outset of launching the initiative, the project personnel were oriented about the project and apprised - what makes a project success.

With respect to monitoring visits, the Executive Director and the Program Director based in Bandaban visit the project almost every month by rotation. They share their field findings with the respective field personnel and follow up in the next visit (what suggestions were carried out and what not). This continuous support helps achieving the project objectives. Their suggestions help further improvement of the lapses and gaps, if any.

The project team assesses what planned activities were carried out and what not, and the reasons why. Based on the status, every staff prepares plan for the next month.

At the project level, the instructors hold weekly meetings headed by the project in charge and at the head office level, there held monthly meetings convened by the Executive Director/the Program Director. It was a large forum participated by focal personnel of each project. It is a forum of accountability/answerability when an individual is subject to another's oversight/direction for performance of tasks or functions. Thus partnership ethos and governance strengthened through inclusion of all project personnel.

In addition to that the Monitoring Officer has been assigned for monitoring of the project. But the position is suggested to re-designate as *Fund Raising and Job Placement Officer*. The rationality of this position is to assist the project to move forward towards the road to sustainability by reducing dependency on outsiders' financial assistance and extending support to the graduates for employment. To meet the purpose he will visit different offices /persons to convince them about the efficiency and the goal of the project and bring job order from them for the project.

Besides, he will contact different employers and convince them to offer employment opportunities for the graduates sharing their socio-economic background. **For a project like this the position added much value for attaining success of the project. The project will provide him monitoring format (scope to improve the present reporting system) based on the fort polio of the position. Every quarter he will report to the management based on which necessary measures will be undertaken. The graduates will have cell number of the Fund Raising and Job Placement Officer who will also have the same of every graduate and employers he met. Upon consultation with the employers he will provide feedback to the project for its adjustment in syllabus and improve the quality of training.**

5.4.2 Maintenance of documents

The project maintains several documents like inventories, progress report, meeting minutes, attendance registers of trainees and staff, bank documents, as means of verifications. All these were found updated.

5.4.3 Financial Management and Purchases with sound policies functioning

The project delivers high quality accounting and financial management services within a framework of sound policies and internal control system. The sound financial policies and internal control systems lead to produce accurate and timely financial information to HF Head Office. All expenditures, plans and budgets are reviewed and approved by the HF management.

Purchases of different items like computers, solar panel, weaving machine, generator, etc followed the purchase policy of the organization by inviting tenders. It is suggested to give code number to each item purchased mentioning the name of the donor and the year of purchase.

5.4.4 Staff Performance Appraisals warrants attention

It must be a regular exercise, which has gone out of attention of the management. The most challenging aspect of a performance appraisal is to measure the actual performance of the employee. Since the performance is measured by tasks performed, there is a continuous process that must be administered in order to monitor the performances throughout the appraisal cycle. It has some positive impacts like:

- It encourages employees to perform better in the future.
- During the appraisal, employees can discuss strengths and weaknesses with a supervisor, in effect, allowing employees to discuss personal concerns.
- It allows employees to identify what skills may be lacking and need to be acquired or improved upon.

5.4.5 Staff development is an integral part of development

The program/organization by itself cannot go on the road towards progress until its staffs are well trained. The project staffs deserve training on:

- Quality Teaching Methodology
- Training of Trainers(ToT)
- On- the- job Training on related subjects of instructors for further development
- Monitoring and Supervision
- and other tailor made training.

The project may draw a staff development plan for the purpose with necessary budget.

5.4.6 Logical Framework Matrix (LFM), a management tool

LFM contains the core elements of the intervention: input, output, outcome and goal. The objectives stated in the project proposal need to be restated to express them as desired objectives.

For each objective, 3-4 key indicators (result based) may be specified. This will help project implementers to monitor the progress of attaining project objectives and in writing the progress report.

5.4.7 Monitoring and Evaluation

Planning & monitoring systems are in place. Skills development and or training are not an end in itself. The objective of any training program is to enhance the employability of trainees and their income. In this context employability, as a general term, refers both to being employed in a formal or non-formal enterprise as well as one's aptitude to work self-employed or to create a small business that responds to the needs of the market. Therefore, key questions that do interest one in regard to the impact of training provided are the following:

- Are the pass-outs making use of what they have learned?
 - Are they doing anything at all?
 - Are they good in doing what they do?
 - Are they making some income with what they do?
 - Have the skills made an impact on their lives?
 - Is the trade still demanding?'
 - Is there any emerging trade to meet the changing needs?
 - Is there any job placement by the project team and particularly by the fund raising and
-

job placement officer?

- Is the job placed person staying in the job?

To answer to these rudimentary questions, a monitoring format needs to be developed and reporting is to do accordingly and periodically. This will help the HF management and the funding agency to understand whether the training offered is relevant and makes sense and effective.

5.5 Phase over/ Sustainability /Exit Strategy

This is the most challenging task for the implementing organization like many other NGOs without micro-credit business. At the beginning of this chapter, the terminology of *phase out* requires necessary clarifications. The phase out or project closure –refers to the withdrawal of involvement without handing over to a local partner, institution or communities either due to time, limited funding, meeting of objectives or failure to meet the objectives.

While phase over or responsibilities transfer –refers to the transfer of project activities or responsibilities to a local partner, communities or a local institution.

Therefore to the understanding based on field visits of the evaluator, the appropriate approaches /modes of EXIT for the project under study will be *phase over (responsibility transfer) in place of phase out as stated in the project document*.

Sustainability and exit strategy is a shared vision of stakeholders concerned. However, it is obviously a big concern of funding agency also. Concerns are “what is the long-term relationship between project/program holder and the donor? How long is the long run? What would happen in the event of withdrawal of outsider’s support? Here comes the question of sustainability. But how this can be made possible for the partner is a matter detailed analysis.

Meanwhile some amount of funds as salary back up deposits has been given by the donor to the project, and it is banked and getting interest. The accumulated interest will contribute partly to support the project expenses. But the amount is small.

Some more amount of fund called endowment fund is necessary to undertake different feasible IGAs. Feasibility study is required with cost- benefit analysis. The income of which will be supportive for the project to continue by its own motion.

The community’s hope is that they would continue to receive support from the Humanitarian Foundation to make their children a skilled workforce and to have better livelihood. The major feature that needs to be covered by the community is their contribution against instructors’ honorarium, admission fees, etc which have already been started. Let this culture be continued and sustained. In addition, the most salient mechanism will be warranted to mobilize and integrate local resources- both public and private .Go on searching and strengthen rapport building with local govt. It appears they are very much supportive to HF.

For attaining sustainability, a sales canter called “Hundred Hands“, has been opened in Bandarban town. The profit and accounts statement (attached) prepared by the HF shows that income over expenditure stands at Tk 0.3 million over time (4.5 years) since beginning of its

journey. A peep into the statement gives an indication that it is gradually rising (refer to Challenges for more information).

According to neighboring shop keepers, their sales figure exceeds Hundred Hand's shop by almost three times as they have sufficient quantity of materials, which are very uncommon to the satisfaction of the customers. Moreover, Hundred Hand is situated at the last part of the main road. According to some other shop owners, location does not count much if the shops have sufficient quantity of materials, sales figure will rise. Customers should see that the shop has sufficient and choice able materials.

It was also found that the project buys its products from its production center of the project and the weaver graduates like towels but very much insignificant in number to meet the buyers' needs at the sales center. The project buys other materials from outside shops (Chittagong) and these included: shirts/*sharees*-women clothes/ baby garments/dresses for indigenous communities etc and they set the price against each item for sale.

There are other sources of fund generation to achieve sustainability in the long run. The statement (attached) shows there are five sources and since 2013 the fund has been generating. As on June 2016 it rises to Tk. almost 1.6 million.

The following are some suggestions to attain sustainability:

- Undertake IGAs feasible (with cost-benefit analysis through participatory process) in the locality other than the present initiatives. Noted that at the moment they have undertaken gardening with fruits and timber trees.
 - Organize training for the interested better off people on computer in the evening against fee.
 - Collect Job order (wooden materials) from different offices/contractors/individuals, etc. They have to earn a good name of making quality products and keep commitment of timely delivery as agreed.
 - To open sustainability fund account in the bank. The fund cannot be utilized till outside funding is available. It is reported they keep the earnings together with the mother account.
 - Produce organic vegetables in the project lands for sale and to meet the need of the dormitory boarders (sustainability account will be thus credited by the actual market price).
 - Use of the fallow lands in the office premises for building guest house for renting (Thanchi Upazila has demands for guest houses). It has become a Tourists' spot of late.
 - Organize "Get together" / Alumnai of the ex-trainees with the budget of exposure cost item. It will be helpful to know their whereabouts and finding scope of work in their
-

respective workplace for those who are still unemployed, prepare an address list with mobile number. They may be encouraged to contribute a certain amount of their earnings for their fellow brothers and sisters (upcoming trainees). It may not be relevant to enforce a policy. Therefore, any contribution likely depends on the good-will of the ex-trainees.

- Developing and marketing tailor-made training for selected industries, e.g the garment industry. Industry attachment is desirable.

6. Challenges

- To run the sales center with the products of the training center and graduates in such a competitive market is a foreseeable challenge.
- HF cannot charge fees and increase other fees from the community attached with being so poor. It is a contradiction of their mandate to work with “have not” people.
- A great challenge is to mobilise indigenous women and girls for weaving trade, that is, shifting from traditional jhum cultivation to village based industry attachment as the Executive Director said. Much investment is there.
- Another challenge is about job placement. The indigenous communities are house-sick people. They want to work and stay in their periphery /communities. Mainstreaming is warranted.
- Women and girls have long demand on tailoring. The project offers traditional method. It should keep linkage with garment industry and training syllabus needs to be revised accordingly with introduction of necessary equipment.
- With the fixed training center, it will be impossible to reach the unreachable poverty-driven communities, thus number of trainees will be less and less in the days to come. There is a challenge to meet their needs for poverty reduction. A mobile unit with appropriate trade may be an answer.
- With same trades for years together without looking into emerging or changing needs the project cannot march on. They must adapt the changes.
- Language barrier of the targeted communities for mainstreaming is another challenge. They must be made out spoken.
- Finding efficient instructors to stay in the difficult communication and remotest part of the country demand more investment.

7. Recommendations

Besides the progress in many indicators of the project interventions, there are some areas, which are doable and needed to consider in implementing the project henceforth and some for future intervention to get desired results:

- The evaluator did not find any people with disabilities (especially challenged people) among the target group. The project should encourage their participation in the program in future.
 - No one should be accepted for training below 14 years of age (though no one was found during interview). The principle should be adhered to in order to prevent any possible conflict with international labour standards on the prevention of child labour.
 - Revisit the objective statements in the project document. Too many ideas in one objective statement appeared complex. Moreover, there seems ambiguity for focusing more on activities in place result- oriented.
-

- Arrange class test after end of each chapter. Provide feedback to the trainees about the results. Continue supporting to the weaker trainees in extra time.
 - Introduce a strategy to reach the unreachable people living in distant places. The concept is “Let the trainer go to the trainees”. One unit with mobile trade training. It is less expensive and brings out a great success. Otherwise enlarge the dormitory facilities with contributory expenses where possible.
 - Prepare a booklet on Telling Tales (success stories) and use the story in class rooms to create interest among the trainees. Ask them their learning from the stories and translation of their learning into their life. This is also essential for the donor to raise funds.
 - Review and refine entrepreneurship trainings with training contents. It will be a part of the training curriculum to be imparted at the last part of the training course. The instructors must be skilled in this field (more in the text).
 - Impart value education along with trade training. Education /Technical training without ethical education remains incomplete. Hence moral and spiritual attributes through value education need to be developed. Experience shows that employees with spiritual education become more proactive, well-mannered and punctual in discharging their duties. Hence the employers appreciate such graduates.
 - Arrange refresher course .The experience indicate that a considerable number of graduates faced problems during employment to find modern equipment, hence up gradation of skills required. For financial limitations, interested graduates may be asked to bear the cost.
 - Training for the staff: The efficiency can be further enhanced in future through investment on staff development to enhance their capacity of quality training (Refer to the text for more information: Efficiency chapter).
 - Improve the lesson plan of the instructors for quality training and extend the practical class duration to the extent as possible (better 80%).
 - The project should look into diversification of trades and endeavour to offer new, market-oriented trades supplementing and or replacing part of the existing ones. New trades should be introduced through only after having undertaken labour market assessments in a number of concerned Upazilas. Options must be enlarged in particular for women (but not stereotyped trades).
 - Increase the number of weaving machine to help engaging the weavers for full time work and thus to augment more income.
 - Reinforce post training services like job placement of the graduates. An industry, producing products but remained unsold, cannot survive. Similar is the case with the training center.
 - Holding opinion sharing meeting with employers in different parts of Chittagong Hill Tracts –Thanchi, Bandarban, Rangamati, Khagrachari and convince them by sharing about the merits of the project, seek their whole hearted cooperation to stand by the side of the neglected communities. It should not be one time event.
 - The project lacks baseline information and data on some main areas. It is suggestive to maintain a data bank on some salient features like income level, food intake, No. of earners, sources of income, house condition, etc before admission in the training courses.
 - Donor is requested to continue funding and to think of providing some” endowment fund” to use it for providential purposes to support the project with the income when the outsiders’ fund will come to an end (refer to sustainability chapter for more information).
-

- A monitoring format needs to revise in line with the comments made in different chapters (especially under monitoring and evaluation). The reporting should be tri-monthly for the HF management and half yearly for the donor or as per their desire.
- Last not the least, the project team will read the report, find out in a team some additional issues / recommendations stated in the report. Thereafter complete the format given below for monitoring, provided the recommendations are acceptable.

Issues raised /recommendations made in the report	Why are these issues/ recommendations?	Steps to be taken against each issue or recommend-	When to be taken	Who is responsible(responsibility sharing)	Indicators of changes (evidences)
1.					
2.					

8. Conclusion

The project under execution is a worthy investment to make skilled work force for better tomorrow. It has challenges also. It needs more investment coupled with qualified and efficient instructors among others.

The targeted beneficiary community deserve a happy and the opportunity to build a brighter future .They are out of reach and trapped in poverty .Vocational education is the key to long term poverty relief. In a country like Bangladesh vocational education is a major instrument, which is a must for economic uplift and poverty alleviation.

Poverty is probably the worst misfortunate afflicting people in the country and particularly the indigenous communities. A very large percentage of them remain miserably poor even today. They are living in subhuman conditions in darkness but they wish they will not die in darkness. The project in execution will help eliminating dark clouds over their head.

9. Annexure

Annex -1 Scope of evaluation

A. Relevance:

1. Was the project design and execution relevant for the local context?
2. How do the stakeholders view the project? Is it still valid?

B. Effectiveness

1. To what extent were the project objectives achieved?
2. To assess the effectiveness of the project as to what extent the measures and approaches were effective for the realization of project objectives.

C. Efficiency:

To assess the overall efficiency of the project in terms of training curriculum, equipment, machinery, and skills of staff, input support/resources utilization, financial management, monitoring and supervision of the project.

D. Results/ Impacts

1. What livelihood difference has the project effected in the beneficiaries' lives (income increase, covering of family basic needs, changes in family living conditions (for example, repair of houses, purchase of items, purchase of animals etc.)?)
2. What social difference has the project effected in the beneficiaries' lives (social status of recognition, self-confidence and self-esteem)?
3. What social difference has the project effected in the female beneficiaries' lives? In particular what social difference has it affected for the members of weaving groups?
4. To assess the usefulness of the training centre facilities
5. To assess the capacity and performance of the trainees in calculating cost of products, net profit, in business planning etc?
6. To assess the risks, challenges, difficulties and progress of graduates to start own businesses.
7. To assess the meaning of start-up support in order to successfully establish a business (tools of trade).

Capacity of the project team:

1. How far the training courses were conducted professionally (including lesson plan, use of materials, sequencing of training topics, annual review of training courses, participatory process (teaching method- theoretical and practical))?
2. Have the team scope for preparing themselves as facilitators in training with the change of times and development needs?

Sustainability of the project:

1. To assess to what extent the sustainability plan is realistic? How does the plan for sustainability look like? How far it is working?
2. To assess the utility of the sales centre in Bandarban.

Recommendations:

To recommend doable suggestions for better implementation of the project in future.

Annex-2a

Table 1: Population of enrolment, graduates, dropout rate (Ist. phase: 2012-2014) of the project trade wise.

Trade	Enrolment		Graduated		Drop out	
	Boys/men	Girls/women	Boys/men	Girls/women	Boys/men	Girls/women
Computer	65(30)	20(11)	64(29)	20(11)	01	00
Carpentry	55(25)	00(0)	55(25)	00(0)	00	00
Weaving	00(0)	52(29)	00(0)	52(29)	00	00
Plant Nursery	100(45)	16(9)	100(46)	16(9)	00	00
Tailoring	00(0)	90(51)	00(0)	90(51)	00	00
Total	220(100)	178(100)	219(100)	178(100)	01	00

Annex-2b

Table 2: Population of enrolment, graduates, dropout rate in the Ist year (2nd phase: 2015-2017) of the project trade wise.

Trade	Enrolment		Graduated		Drop out	
	Boys/men	Girls/women	Boys/men	Girls/women	Boys/men	Girls/women
Computer	14(20)	16(15)	14(20)	16(15)	00	00
Carpentry	30(42)	00	30(42)	00	00	00
Weaving	00(0)	23(21)	00(0)	23(21)	00	00
Plant Nursery	27(38)	21(19)	27(38)	21(19)	00	00
Tailoring	00(0)	48(45)	00(0)	48(45)	00	00
Total	71(100)	108(100)	71(100)	108(100)	00	00

Note: Figures in parentheses represent percentage.

Annex-3 Profit and Loss Accounts of Sales Centre/attached

Annex-4 Sources of fund for Financial Sustainability /attached

Annex-5 Comparative changes

Indicators	Before Training	After Training	Impacts
Scope of work	Limited to jhum cultivation	Increased scope for work through technology transfer for earning. Change of traditional profession by which food security is threatened.	Living standard improving through various avenues like :creation of employment opportunities, increase of income, purchasing power increase, additional source of income, producing safe food by organic farming
Skills	Unskilled	Technically skilled	
Employment	Unemployed/underemployed	Employed(wage or self)	
Income of the skilled person per month(gross)	.Some were vagrants, No work, Joined as family labour in jhum cultivation as surplus labors	Tk 1500-Tk6,000(wage employment) Tk 30,000(maximum) in case self-employment	
No. of earners in the family	All involved in jhum cultivation,	Increased/ added .Extra earning from the use of training -learning.	
Interest in Education	Less or no income. hence did not think of education	Increased awareness among community and outlook for female education in families and community increased.	
Meal taken/ Food intake a day	2 meals a day with poor quality	3 meals a day with fish/egg once or twice a week in their meal and increase in number of items.	
House condition	Less number of house/Dilapidated condition	Built new houses/repaired houses,	
Animal Husbandry	No or Less number of poultry and livestock.	Increased rearing of poultry and livestock.	
Use of agriculture ingredients	Used 100% chemical fertilizer in vegetable gardening.	The community people are aware about the danger effects of using chemical fertilizer. Started	

		organic fertilizer and bringing fallow land under cultivation	
Tree plantation	Less awareness on environment protection and Less number of trees	Increased awareness on environment protection and No of plantation increased	
Dignity /Self confidence	Not much weighed, being unemployed	They feel self-esteemed, they are weighed as they contribute in family expenses, bear educational expenses , built or repaired houses and purchased some assets (some tangible changes), creating employment opportunities for others	